

# Session 14:

## EA Site-Visit Exercise—Waste Dump

### Site Background

We will visit the Hulene waste dump. In 2018, the waste dump made international news due to a massive landslide of the rubbish that led to numerous fatalities. Two news reports are annexed to this briefing.

### Activity Scenario & Site Visit Objectives

*(Note: this scenario is not an actual USAID activity, it is only for workshop purposes)*

More than 5 years ago, the Maputo municipal government identified the need to close the waste dump due to public health and safety issues, which in turn requires an alternative site to receive the waste. An initiative is underway, with support from South Korean government, to site and build a new, controlled landfill.

**In parallel, and in response to the landslide disaster, USAID has committed to assist the municipality to close the Hulene dump and redevelop the area. Your team will be responsible for designing and implementing this activity.**

Your team has determined that this activity will require a scoping statement, almost certainly leading to an Environmental Assessment (EA). The team also knows that a number of major questions about design of this activity remain to be settled, and is determined that the EA process inform these questions.

Therefore, you are conducting a site visit to gather more information to: (1) inform preliminary identification of the likely preferred action and its alternatives, (2) develop the TOR for the scoping statement, and (3) inform your planning for incorporating the EA findings into activity design and implementation.

Your field team includes the MEO, the AOR, Mission technical experts and municipal officials.

### Site visit instructions

During your site visit:

- Observe both social and environmental conditions.
- Consider how to define **purpose and need** of this activity – this must be oriented around public health and safety, not “closure of the site”
- Consider whether closure is the **ONLY** intervention that can achieve the underlying purpose and need. If not, what are the alternatives?

- If you see closure as the only option, consider major alternatives with respect to closure and redevelopment– e.g. capping vs removal of the waste, allowing dwellings on/immediately adjacent to the site to remain---or not; nature of re-use of the site. Think about the actions that will be entailed in each major alternative.
- Consider the environmental and social impacts of these major alternatives. (Remember to consider indirect impacts.)
- Make a sketch of the site to inform follow-on discussions when the team returns from the field
- Whether they were available or not, consider potential stakeholders that should be consulted as part of the scoping process

## Back in the classroom

Upon return to the Hotel, your group will review observations from the field visit and:

1. Agree on a statement of purpose and need
2. Identify key design choices/alternatives for major elements of the activity
3. Develop a matrix or matrixes that allows comparison of the major environmental and social impact of these alternatives
4. Populate this matrix (matrixes) with qualitative “guesstimates” of relative impacts (and relative costs, if you can)
5. Use this discussion to inform a preliminary proposed activity design (“Proposed Actions”) – i.e. which set of key design choices will you adopt, at least as a starting point? What are the primary alternatives?
6. Based on your proposed actions and your comparison matrix, identify the minimum set of environmental and social impacts that the scoping statement must address. (These are the impacts that may be significant. If impacts can obviously be eliminated as non-significant, or are inherently addressed and mitigated in the design, they need not be part of the scoping statement TOR.)
7. Specify the minimum set of stakeholders that the scoping team must engage with. Provide at least minimum guidance as to how different classes of stakeholders are to be engaged (e.g., individual interviews, small group meetings, townhalls, etc.)?
8. Identify your next steps as a design team. Make a plan for including the EA results in your project phasing.

---

## News Coverage: Mozambique rubbish dump collapse kills at least 17

Source: BBC News, 20 February 2018, <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-43117116>

**At least 17 people - including children - have been killed in Mozambique's capital, Maputo, and many more injured after a huge mound of rubbish collapsed, officials say.**

The pile of waste, some 15m (49ft) high, gave way in heavy rains at 03:00 local time (01:00 GMT) on Monday.

The dump is known to be home to some of the city's poorest residents, who build makeshift camps amid the rubbish.

Five homes on the edge were also crushed in the disaster. Rescue workers are continuing to search for survivors. A spokesman for the emergency services, Leonilde Pelembe, warned it was likely there were more victims under the waste.

"The information we received from local authorities is that the number of people living in those houses exceeds the number of deaths recorded," Mr Pelembe said.



The Hulene district of Maputo is one of the most deprived parts of the capital. Many, including children, have little choice but to make their homes either on or next to the dump.

The dump not only provides them with food but also goods to sell, our correspondent Jose Tembe explains.

---

## News Coverage:

### Living and dying on a rubbish dump: the landfill collapse in Mozambique

The Guardian: Mon 26 Feb 2018 06.50 EST. Shaun Swingler in Maputo.

<https://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2018/feb/26/explosion-fatal-rubbish-landslide-mozambique-hulene-dump>

Sixteen people died last week when heavy rains triggered a landslide in Maputo's dump, leading to calls for the mayor's resignation, and exposing the grim realities of life in one of the poorest parts of the city

Last Monday at 3am, rain pummelled Mozambique's capital. The country has a notorious wet season and in recent weeks many residents had complained of the high rainfall.

In Hulene, an impoverished neighbourhood 10km from the city centre, lies the Hulene dump: a 17-hectare (42-acre) mountain of rubbish that towers 15 metres above the people who have made their homes on its fringes.

"It was late and the rain was pouring down, but I was woken up by something that sounded like an explosion," says Paulina Cosa, a resident of the settlement.

The overnight downpour set off an avalanche of rubbish that consumed more than 10 houses on its periphery, [killing 16 people and wounding six others](#). A mother and her newborn baby were among the casualties.

“We came out and heard some people screaming, we didn’t know what was happening,” says Maria Jose, who lives less than 100 metres from the collapse. “When we went to investigate we found that the waste had come down to the houses and a lot of people were among it, trying to dig it up and rescue their families.”

“A lot of people came out to help,” says Joao Mucavele, the city’s director of health and cemeteries. “People from the municipality, from all over the neighbourhood and from the Red Cross, gave a helping hand.”

Recovery operations have now stopped and, three days after the collapse, earth-moving equipment pushes back the mounds of rubbish to reclaim the 100 or so metres of land that was swallowed up by the detritus.

“We are now working to return the waste to where it came from,” says Mucavele. “The people who were living here will be given help, but no one can live here from now on.”

In the interim, Mucavele says, all residents at the site of the collapse have been relocated to a temporary shelter in the Ferroviario neighbourhood, about 30 minutes south of the dump.

Hulene rubbish dump is an assault on the senses. The smell of two decades of a city’s waste lingers long after you’ve left the site, and the vast pools of stagnant water mean the air is thick with mosquitoes. The swampy roads in and out are difficult to navigate.

But the dump provides its residents with a source of income in one of the most impoverished areas of the city, in a country where almost half of the population [lives below the poverty line](#).

[Peri-urban](#) waste picking is a common livelihood across the continent, where people remain tied to informal economies and receive little social or economic protection.

Cosa, who has lived at the dump since 1994, makes her living collecting recyclable items. She says she sells them to Chinese recycling buyers and earns around 6p a day.

A lack of adequate housing to meet the high demand in Maputo, the country’s economic hub, has also driven people to set up homes around the dump. The Hulene neighbourhood underwent a population boom during the Mozambican civil war from 1977 to 1992. People fleeing the war in rural areas further north came to seek refuge in urban centres like Maputo.

“The collapse speaks to issues of poverty and urban planning,” Matthew Cochrane, a Red Cross spokesman, told CNN. “Those affected are the poorest of the poor. They have no choice but to live there, and when there’s heavy rain, they’re the ones who find themselves on the front line.”

Maria Jose’s house was not damaged in the landslide, so she has not yet been relocated. She was born in Hulene dump and has lived there most of her life. Since the collapse, she has decided to move away as the risk is too great for her and her one-year-old child.

“The conditions are terrible with the diseases, the mosquitoes, and now this,” she says. “We can’t stay here any more, it’s too difficult to handle this situation.”

A local environmental activism group, Livaningo, has been campaigning for 15 years for the closure of the dump because they say it is operating far above its capacity, creating dangerous living conditions.

“What happened on Monday we’ve been telling the government would happen for years,” says Manuel Cardoso, an activist at Livaningo. “We don’t think they see solving this problem that’s been around since 2001 as a priority. They have to be held responsible for their inaction.”

In 2013, after pressure from numerous groups, the city government agreed to close the Hulene rubbish dump and relocate it to Matlemele, in the neighbouring city of Matola. However, the relocation never happened. The city blamed budget constraints.

Since the collapse at Hulene, the city has re-energised its efforts to relocate the dump. However, Mucavele says a number of people are illegally occupying the Matlemele site, halting progress. According to Mucavele it will cost \$16m (£11.4m) to relocate these people, and an additional \$15m to relocate Hulene dump.

He says there has been a plan and fiscal timeline implemented for this relocation but was unable to answer how long the relocation will take.

In the interim, local government has agreed to cover the victim’s funeral costs.

[...] In response to the loss of life, opposition parties have been quick to condemn the government.